

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-02-17 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

1. Attendees

Michael Sweet	Apple
Lee Farrell	Canon
Glen Petrie	Epson
Ira McDonald	High North
Jerry Thrasher	Lexmark
Ole Skov	MPI
Nancy Chen	Oki Data
Bill Wagner	TIC
Paul Tykodi	Tykodi Consulting
Pete Zehler	Xerox

On Tuesday morning, Ira McDonald opened the IDS session and provided the planned agenda:

- Introductions, Assign Minute Takers
- IPP/2.0 Review
- IPP PSX and
- IPP Production Printing Set2
- Action Items and Next Steps

2. PWG Operational Policy

It was noted that all attendees should be aware that the meeting is conducted under the PWG Membership and Intellectual Property rules. There were no objections.

3. IPP/2.0 Review

Ira encouraged everyone to read the latest IPPv20 specification draft, in preparation for the Last Call. He indicated the following about the document:

- Status is Stable Draft
- Working Group last call ends 6 March
- Required Operations and Attributes list is stable
- Current version is 24 January 2009
<ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/ippv2-wd/wd-ipp20-20090124.pdf>

He noted that the current edition of the specification does not include IPPv2.2—but will be delayed for a second edition of the document.

Ira then led a review of portions of the draft document, also calling attention to the Abstract and the Introduction.

Ira indicated that if any companies are interested in interoperability testing, he and/or Shah Bhatti are willing to facilitate the effort. Please contact one of them.

He noted that Section 4 outlines the different standards that comprise IPPv2.0 and v2.1.

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-02-17 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

Section 5 details the specific Operations that are required and optional for each version. Document references are provided for the definitions of each Operation.

Section 6 provides the lists of attributes that are required for the two versions.

A discussion occurred between Ira and Michael about the Media names, as to whether the specification should be silent if an implementation uses a media type to indicate the size. It was agreed that Ira will further clarify change the media size names note for v2.1 to explain correct mapping and recommended behavior.

Ira suggested that a footnote should be added to the table in section 6.3 Required IPP Version 2.1 Attributes indicating that all values of job-hold-until must be supported.

Ira also explained that legacy values of media types should be converted.

Ira noted an error in the v2.1 table of attributes: media-col-ready should be deleted from the table. There was some confusion about the current wording of Note 2 in this table. It needs to clarify better which items are actually OPTIONAL. Some people are interpreting the current note text suggesting that some entries in the table are OPTIONAL. Suggested text: attributes not listed in this table are OPTIONAL.

Section 7 Conformance Requirements needs re-writing for better readability—probably into a tabular format, with additional interoperability conformance information.

Section 8 will also benefit from some additional text.

In Section 9, the phrase “NOTE WELL” will be changed to “IMPORTANT”. [Evidently, a few individuals did not like the phrase.]

4. IPP PSX

Ira highlighted the following status of the IPP Printer State Reasons (PSX) document:

- Status is Prototype Draft
- Working Group last call ends 6 March
- IPP <-> Printer MIB mapping tables are stable
- Current version is 8 February 2009
<ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippstate10-20090208.pdf>

He noted that the IPP PSX specification has been prototyped, but no official prototype report was created.

Ira explained that Appendix A provides information on why certain design choices were not taken in the creation of the specification.

He then provided a review of the various sections and an overview of their content.

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-02-17 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

It was noted that IPP PSX is required for IPPv2.1, and is already shipping in Linux. Ira asked for any objections to this requirement, but there were none.

The Conformance Requirements section will be re-written into tabular form to improve legibility.

The highlighted text in sections 5.2 and 5.3 should not be highlighted. The highlighting will be removed.

ACTION: Ira will address the following rule: Finishing subunit generic alerts from printer MIB must be mapped to their specific equivalent alert code in Printer State Reason.

Ira encouraged people to review the ABNF in the document and check for accuracy.

It was suggested that Table 6-1 could be replaced by an algorithmic formula, but the group agreed to keep it explicitly included.

5. IPP Production Printing Set2

Ira explained that the IPP Production Printing Set2 activity is a gating factor for the definition of IPPv2.2.

6. Action Items and Next Steps

Ira provided the Next Steps:

- IPP/2.0
 - * Complete WG last call and revisions
 - * Publish as second Stable Draft (2.0/2.1)
 - * PWG Last Call spanning April PWG face-to-face
- IPP Printer State Reasons Extensions (PSX)
 - * Complete WG last call and revisions
 - * Complete IANA Considerations (IPP & Printer MIB)
 - * Publish as first Stable Draft
 - * PWG Last Call spanning April PWG face-to-face
- IPP Production Printing Set2
 - * Interim Draft by April PWG face-to-face
 - * Include in IPP/2.0 Second Edition (later 2009)

Ira urged everyone to review the IPPv2.0 and PSX specifications. He would like to target the PWG Last Call for the April face-to-face meeting. At least eight people will need to vote to accept the document.

7. Next Teleconference

March 2, 2009 1:00pm Eastern.

IPPV2 meeting adjourned.