Internet Printing Protocol WG Minutes
June 2, 2014

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm PT June 2, 2014.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)
Pete Zehler (Parc)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
    a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Approve IPP minutes from previous meetings
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20140428.pdf
    b. Approved as posted
    c. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20140513.pdf
    d. Approved as posted
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike)
    a. IETF LDAP Printer Schema (Ira)
        -   http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/draft-mcdonald-ldap-printer-schema-07-20140313.pdf
        -   IPP WG reviewed on 31 March
        -   ready for IETF Last Call
    b. IETF IPP over HTTPS Binding and 'ipps' URI Scheme (Ira)
        -   http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/draft-mcdonald-ipps-uri-scheme-12-20140420.pdf
        -   completed edits from IPP WG review on 14 April
        -   ready for IETF Last Call
    c. IPP Self-Certification (Mike)
        -   http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20140509-rev.pdf
        -   Prototype draft - waiting for prototype reports
        -   reviewed at PWG F2F in May
        -   schedule: July-ish for beta tools, spec update, and web site, definitely by August F2F
    d. IPP Shared Infrastructure Extensions (Mike)
        -   http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsix10-20140226-rev.pdf
        -   Prototype draft - waiting for prototype reports
        -   NOT reviewed at PWG F2F in May

- schedule: as per F2F
  e. IPP Finishings v2.0 (Mike)
    - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings20-20140509-rev.pdf
    - Prototoype draft - waiting for prototype reports
    - Ira/ Mike still need to cross-check w/ Finisher MIB (RFC 3805)
    - reviewed at PWG F2F in May
    - schedule: as per F2F
  f. IPP Scan Service (Pete Zehler)
    - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippscan10-20140509-rev.pdf
    - Stable draft - completed IPP WG last call
    - reviewed at PWG F2F in May
    - ready for PWG Last Call? (pending SC approval)
      - Q: What about security access tokens in destination-uris?
        - A: Probably not in destination-uris, what about "destination-credentials (1setOf collection)" or "destination-tokens (1setOf collection)" operation attribute?
        - What about IDS element group name?
        - Member attributes for common authentication schemes
        - xxx-supported for supported auth member attributes
      - Q: Do we register OAuth as a uri-authentication-supported value?
        - A: Possibly, or as part of IPP SCS
      - Action: Pete to post proposal for destination authentication information to IPP list
      - Conceptually this could also be used to support authentication of referenced URIs for Print-URI/Send-URI
      - Continue discussion on IPP list
      - Also make printer-current-time as REQUIRED
4. Proposal for IPP "printer-output-tray" extensions (Smith)
   a. http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2014/017968.html
   b. also "printer-input-tray" and "printer-supply" extensions
   c. Smith to flesh out proposal per PWG F2F in May
   d. Mike recently suggested adding this to IPP System Control Service
   e. Smith will be posting proposal to IPP list
   f. Ira will be posting initial draft of IPP SCS with proposed changes and Mike's pre-initial draft
   g. Also DTMF/CIM mapping of Printer MIB did a weighted review of all properties to come up with what is required, recommended, and optional. Ira will post a link, good start for SCS as well.
5. Proposal for IPP "printer-alert" conformance update (Soma)
   a. http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2014/017986.html
   b. Q: move prtAlertTime to RECOMMENDED?
      - A: Yes
   c. Q: move prtAlertDescription to RECOMMENDED?

- - A: Would be nice but few provide useful information here
    d. Q: What about date-time / printer-current-time / printer-xxx-change-date-time
        - - A: Make RECOMMENDED in FaxOut errata update
        - - A: Make RECOMMENDED in Everywhere errata update
        - - Make REQUIRED in IPP Scan, too
    e. Also review DTMF/CIM weighting of properties for other candidates for RECOMMENDED
6. Errata in 'sGray' in PWG Raster (James Cloos)
    a. http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2014/018011.html
    b. discrepancy between 'sRGB' and 'sGray' gamma
    c. James is using Ghostscript 9 definition (from 2011), vs. rest of industry using sRGB definition (first used in CUPS in 2002).
        - - James will file bug with Ghostscript devs
7. Review of IPP Implementor's Guide v2.0 (Smith)
    a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippig20-20140513-rev.pdf
    b. Prototoype draft - waiting for prototype reports
    c. partial review at PWG F2F in May
    d. continue review at section 5.8
    e. Section 5.8
        - - Also Validate-Document
        - - Reiterate that document-format should be supplied for valid values
        - - "When responding to an IPP Get-Printer-Attributes request, the Printer filters the set of attributes and values [RFC2911] to those that are acceptable to a Job Creation, Validate-Job, and Validate-Document operation."
        - - "Table N lists the Printer attributes that are discussed in the following subsections."
        - - Add caption to table (Table N - Printer Capability Attributes)
        - - Move "origin" column to right, name it "Reference", drop brackets and use "RFC 2911", "PWG 5100.13", etc.
        - - "Purpose" -> "Description"
        - - For "printer-get-attributes-supported" -> "Lists the set of attributes a Client can use to filter the response from a Get-Printer-Attributes request" or something like that
        - - For "document-format-varying-attributes" is it both the supported and default attributes
        - - For "job-creation-attributes-supported" it is the Job Template (not Document Template) attributes
        - - For "document-creation-attributes-supported" include Validate-Document operation, "Document Creation operations"
        - - For "printer-config-change-xxx", use definition from JPS3 instead of invoking the "event" word
            - - "This attribute helps a Client or operator to determine how recently any of the Printer description attributes has been changed."
            - - Caching of defaults and capabilities and ready values

- "Job Creation operation"
- Also add "xxx-default", "xxx-ready", "xxx-supported", "media-col-database", any other attributes in subsections to tables
- Use "medium accent 1" table style

  f. Global: "Job" instead of "job"
  g. Global: "Job Template" instead of "job template"\
  h. Global: "operation attributes" instead of "Operation attributes"
  i. Stopped before 5.8.1

8. Next meetings:
  a. June 16: IPPSIX + IPP Finishings 2.0 / JDFMAP
  b. June 30: Implementor's Guide 2.0

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference calls June 16 and June 30, 2014 at 3pm ET
- Action: Pete to post proposal for destination authentication information to IPP list
- Action: Mike to post media size summary to IPP and add to registry (PENDING - need to add to registry)
- Action: Smith to create white paper for extension to printer-output-tray, printer-input-tray, and printer-supply (DONE - will be part of System Control Service)
- Action: Ira to add comments to Printer MIB for fax-modem-protocol-error and xxx-recoverable-storage-error - suffix dropped from IPP keyword with corresponding suffix (-error, -report, -warning) added depending on the printer state. (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to submit IANA registration for IPP printer-state-reasons updates for fax-modem-protocol and xxx-recoverable-storage (PENDING)
- Action: Ira to submit Printer MIB registration for new xxx-missing PrtAlertCodeTC values (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to propose an approach for deprecation of IPP attributes and values in the IANA registry (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira/Paul/SM workgroup to review values of finishings-col member attributes to make sure we have parity with common JDF values (PENDING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to make sure finishing MIB and Finishings 2.0 are in sync (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to add spec best-practices to WD template, fix abstract wording (PENDING)