

Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes July 11, 2016

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET on July 11, 2016.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Matthew Morikawa (Kyocera Document Solutions)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Previous Minutes
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20160627.pdf>
 - Fix Bill's affiliation (TIC, not TCS)
 - Approved with attendee change
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike/Smith)
 - IETF IPP/1.1 Updates (Mike/Ira)
 - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2910bis-08.txt>
 - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis-09.txt>
 - Changes for new IETF Proposed Standards
 - Alexey Melnikov (IETF ART AD) as AD sponsor on 06/02/16
 - Barry Leiba as Document Shepherd on 06/09/16
 - Alexey Melnikov sent AD review of RFC2910bis on 06/07/16
 - IETF Last Call of RFC2910bis on 06/13/16 to 07/11/16 - complete
 - Mike to post minor edits with fix for double link, plus any other comments that might have been missed
 - IETF Last Call of RFC2911bis on 07/01/16 to 07/29/16
 - Schedule - IESG Telechat on 08/04/16
 - IPP Finishings 2.1 (Smith)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings21-20160509-rev.pdf>
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/Finishings-2.1-Orientation-and-Feed-Orientation-Extensions-2016-06-13.pdf>
 - Interim draft
 - Reviewed by IPP WG on 06/13/16

- Schedule - review at August PWG F2F
- IPP Implementor's Guide v2 (Smith/Mike)
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018829.html>
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018830.html>
 - Discussed by IPP WG on 06/13/16
 - Issue is that section 5.6.8 of PWG 5100.13 does not explicitly mention 1setOf syntax for members normally single-valued
 - Need examples of both, show equivalency of separate and combined duplex constraint examples
 - Smith to submit issue on PWG 5100.13 to clarify 1setOf usage for constraints in section 5.6.8
 - Schedule - Errata for IPP Implementor's Guide v2
- IPP Everywhere Self-Cert / Tools / Issues (Smith/Mike)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/candidates/cs-ippeveselfcert10-20160219-5100.20.pdf>
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018828.html>
 - Various issues discussed by IPP WG on 05/23/16
 - Add Print Server requirements issue from Smith on 05/26/16
 - Mike to put together a list of attributes, operations, and/or values that cannot be supported by a Print Server (Issue #11)
 - Action: Mike to post self-cert release notes with known issues/workarounds
 - Schedule - Errata for IPP Everywhere Self-Cert / Tools
- 4. Updated Canon proposal for job-account-password (Rick)
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018847.html>
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018850.html>
 - Initial discussion
 - Schedule - review at August PWG F2F
 - Reviewed slides and initial feedback from Mike
 - Q: Concerning authenticated users and limitation/validation of job ticket values, has this ever been defined anywhere?
 - A: Foundation laid in RFC 2911 ("most authenticated requesting user") where users are part of groups with certain roles (administrator, operator, end user)
 - Subsequent discussions have often brought up the need for a Get-User-Supported-Values operation (like Get-Printer-Attributes, but filtered based on user policy/available capabilities), specifically for color, duplex, media, etc.
 - Q: PWG 5100.3/16 changes/clarifications proposed in December 2015?
 - A: Daniel will talk with others inside Xerox and get back to us
- 5. New "finishings" keywords for Swedish hole punch (Smith)
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018853.html>
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018856.html>
 - Mike suggested this is redundant w/ existing keywords/enums
 - Also, US English keywords are required by IPP rules
 - Q: Are we OK with a certain level of uncertainty in finishings?
 - A: Yes

- Proposal: Define a keyword extension mechanism to allow "standard" identification of finishing variants, e.g. finishing-template='punch-quad-left_triobinder'
 - These can be used with the finishing-col attribute
 - Document in Finishings 2.1 update
 - Vendor provides localization in strings files.
- 6. IPP 3D Printing Extensions (Mike)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipp3d10-20160430-rev.pdf>
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018857.html>
 - Prototype draft
 - Reviewed by PWG F2F on 04/27/16
 - Initial prototyping feedback from Mike on 07/08/16
 - Schedule - PWG Last Call in Q3/Q4 2016
 - Mike intends to post an updated prototype draft before the next conference call
 - Include informational reference to ippsample code
 - Will be reviewed during July 18th 3D conference call
- 7. Review of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20160706-rev.pdf>
 - Interim draft - completed all edits from 06/27/16 review
 - Issue: Remove/downsize "system-totals" (dozens of attributes)
 - Issue: Design for "resource-authenticator"
 - Issue: Indices for "configured-subunits" for multiple output devices?
 - Reviewed by IPP WG on 06/27/16
 - Schedule - Prototype draft in Q3/Q4 2016
 - Table 4 in Section 5.6:
 - Add proper note for resource-owner-col (missing)
 - Table 5 in Section 5.7:
 - Q: Drop resource-owner-col here?
 - A: Maybe, resources are long-lived like printers and systems, vs. jobs which are shorter-lived so job owner is read-only
 - Add note for (date-)time-at-installed, when they get installed, analogous to (date-)time-at-processing for jobs
 - Section 7.1.4:
 - Also for Job Creation operations?
 - Copy to job-originating-user-vcard or job-owner-col attribute?
 - Need to talk about "most authenticated" getting copied to object
 - Section 7.3.1 (power-log-col)
 - Talk about minimizing the number of log entries, MUST log final transition in sequences, can omit intermediate state transitions
 - Section 7.3.9 (system-configured-printers): Add table listing member attributes?
 - Section 7.3.9.8: Drop queued-job-count
 - Stopped at section 7.3.10 (system-configured-resources)
 - TODO: Accept all changes up to 7.3.10

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference calls July 18, 2016 at 4pm ET (3D) and July 25, 2016 at 3pm ET
- Action: Mike to post self-cert release notes with known issues/workarounds
- Action: Mike to work with ISTO to purchase a new code signing certificate (ONGOING - Working with Smith and Jane at ISTO to get a new GoDaddy cert)
- Action: Mike to send updated IANA IPP registrations to Ira (PENDING)
- Action: Smith to submit issue on PWG 5100.13 to clarify 1setOf usage for constraints in section 5.6.8 (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to put together a list of attributes, operations, and/or values that cannot be supported by an IPP Everywhere print server (ONGOING - Issue #11)
- Action: Smith to send IPP Everywhere self-cert reminder to pwg-announce list (PENDING - posting will include description of the known issues w/workaround, which will be worked in parallel)