

# Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes July 25, 2016

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET on July 25, 2016.

## Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)  
Ira McDonald (High North)  
Michael Sweet (Apple)  
Paul Tykodi (TCS)  
Bill Wagner (TIC)

## Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
  - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Approve IPP minutes from previous meetings
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20160711.pdf>
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20160718.pdf>
  - Approved as posted
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike/Smith)
  - IETF IPP/1.1 Updates (Mike/Ira)
    - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-ietf-ipp-1.1-08.txt>
    - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-ietf-ipp-1.1-09.txt>
    - Changes for new IETF Proposed Standards
    - Alexey Melnikov (IETF ART AD) as AD sponsor on 06/02/16
    - Barry Leiba as Document Shepherd on 06/09/16
    - Alexey Melnikov sent AD review of RFC2910bis on 06/07/16
    - Alexey Melnikov sent AD review of RFC2911bis on 07/17/16
    - OPS-DIR review of RFC2910bis on 07/13/16
    - IETF Last Call of RFC2910bis on 06/13/16 to 07/11/16 - complete
    - IETF Last Call of RFC2911bis on 07/01/16 to 07/29/16 - ends Friday
    - Schedule - IESG Telechat on 08/04/16
  - IPP 3D Printing Extensions (Mike)
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipp3d10-20160714-rev.pdf>
    - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018857.html>
    - Prototype draft
    - Initial prototyping feedback from Mike on 07/08/16
    - Reviewed by IPP WG on 07/18/16 - stopped at section 8.2
    - Schedule - PWG Last Call in Q3/Q4 2016
  - IPP Implementor's Guide v2 (Smith/Mike)

- <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018829.html>
- <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018830.html>
- Discussed by IPP WG on 06/13/16
- Schedule - Errata for IPP Implementor's Guide v2
- IPP Everywhere Self-Cert / Tools / Issues (Smith/Mike)
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/candidates/cs-ippeveselfcert10-20160219-5100.20.pdf>
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018828.html>
  - Discussed by IPP WG on 05/23/16
  - Schedule - Errata for IPP Everywhere Self-Cert / Tools
- 4. "printer-resolution-supported" vs "pwg-raster-resolution-supported" (Smith)
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018874.html>
  - Resolved - see Smith and Mike's exchange
  - Schedule - review at August PWG F2F
  - Action: Mike to file an issue against PWG 5102.4 to talk about relationship between pwg-raster-document-resolution-supported and printer-resolution-supported
- 5. PWG 5100.8 Issue #42: -actual should be in Job Status group (Mike)
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018867.html>
  - Note that "xxx-actual" are Job Receipt (read-only)
  - Schedule - Errata for IPP "-actual" Attributes
  - Action: Mike to move -actual attributes to the Job Status group, update issue #42 accordingly
- 6. PWG 5100.11 Issue #43: add Job Password Repertoire attributes
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2016/018873.html>
  - Additional Job/Printer attributes
  - Schedule - Errata for IPP JPS2
- 7. Review of IPP Finishings 2.1 (Smith)
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings21-20160720-rev.pdf>
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/Finishings-2.1-Orientation-and-Feed-Orientation-Extensions-2016-06-13.pdf>
  - Interim draft
  - Next status: Prototype
  - Section 5.1:
    - Lines 493-494: Update last sentence (Figure 3 and long-edge-first)
    - Also could talk about media-feed-orientation (which provides actual rotation) vs. just long/short-edge feed - media-feed-orientation comes from media-col-database/ready.media-source-properties
    - Figure 3: Tweak scale of figure so caption fits
  - Section 5.2:
    - Drop blank lines 653 and 665
  - Section 5.2.1:
    - "Keywords can be extended by appending a qualifying label ..."
    - "and 'trio-binder' is the extension qualifier".
    - Single quotes around all values/strings. (double quotes are for attribute names)
    - Mention printer-strings-uri attribute for localization - keyword would

- be localized via string catalog referenced by the "printer-strings-uri" Printer Description attribute [PWG5100.13], or something like that.
- Maybe break out discussion of localization so that it applies to all keyword values (right now it is buried with vendor extensions)
- Section 6.10:
  - Line 1158: "Job" (capitalize)
  - Line 1160: Reword "need not" - they can be specified separately or together.
  - Line 1170: "There could/can be situations", double quotes around "finishings-col"
  - Lines 1171-1173: Replace "or similar situation" with "etc.", "These situations are described by the Printer using the "job-constraints-supported" and "job-resolvers-supported" Printer Description attributes [PWG5100.13]."
  - Line 1177: finishings-col={finishing-template='staple-top-left'}
  - Line 1178: finishings=20
  - Line 1179: Drop orientation-requested
  - Line 1180: media-col={media-source='tray-2'}
  - Line 1186: media-col={media-source='tray-1'}
- Section 6.18:
  - "As with finDeviceTable, Printers MUST only list those finishers that are currently attached."
- Line 1596: Move 'fold-engineering-z' up between 'fold-double-gate' and 'fold-gate'
- Action: Mike to add item to IPP F2F slides: use SMI code as prefix for vendor keywords?
- Smith will post prototype draft, move to stable draft shortly thereafter in preparation for a WG last call
- 8. Review of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20160720-rev.pdf>
  - Interim draft - completed all edits from 07/11/16 review
  - Issue: Remove/downsize "system-totals" (dozens of attributes)
  - Issue: Design for "resource-authenticator"
  - Issue: Indices for "configured-subunits" for multiple output devices?
  - Reviewed by IPP WG on 07/11/16
  - Stopped at section 7.3.10 system-configured-resources
  - Schedule - Prototype draft in Q3/Q4 2016
  - Section 5.10:
    - Make Job Status, READ-ONLY, specified in Job Creation request, etc.
  - Section 7.1.4:
    - Lines 1397-1398 - Job Status but Description for others, drop Set-Job-Attributes
    - Line 1399: "The recorded System, Printer, ... values MUST identify ..."
    - Line 1400: Drop "defined in", "as discussed for the "job-originating-user-name" Job Status attribute [RFC2911]"

- Maybe "As with the "requesting-user-name" operation attribute [RFC2911], the most authenticated user information is copied to the System, Printer, Resource, or Job object."
- Section 7.3.1:
  - Check 'resetNMI' value - 'reset-nmi' instead?
  - Line 1882: "transitions" (plural)
- Section 7.3.10.3:
  - Title: "resource-id (integer(1:MAX))"
- Global: Check for ":max" and replace with ":MAX"
- Section 7.3.10.x:
  - Fix section 7.x references to correct sections in PWG 5108.06
- Section 7.3.11:
  - Delete this whole section, we have no first class operations to use this information or to assign subunits to services
  - Maybe talk about this in an appendix talking about differences from the semantic model definitions - services have implicit assignment of subunits based on function/type, so there is no need for this information. Could be added in the future if an extension adds explicit subunit assignment.
- Also whack system-totals attribute (just get counters from services themselves)
- Stopped at end of 7.3.11 (system-configured-subunits)

## Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference calls August 8, 2016 at 4pm ET (3D) and August 15, 2016 at 3pm ET, skipping August 1st which is a holiday in Canada
- Action: Mike to file an issue against PWG 5102.4 to talk about relationship between pwg-raster-document-resolution-supported and printer-resolution-supported
- Action: Mike to move -actual attributes to the Job Status group, update issue #42 accordingly
- Action: Mike to add item to IPP F2F slides: use SMI code as prefix for vendor keywords?
- Action: Mike to send updated IANA IPP registrations to Ira (PENDING - need to move -actual attributes to the Job Status group)
- Action: Smith to submit issue on PWG 5100.13 to clarify 1setOf usage for constraints in section 5.6.8 (DONE)
- Action: Mike to put together a list of attributes, operations, and/or values that cannot be supported by an IPP Everywhere print server (ONGOING - Issue #11)
- Action: Smith to send IPP Everywhere self-cert reminder to pwg-announce list (PENDING - posting will include description of the known issues w/workaround, which will be worked in parallel)