

Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes October 19, 2016

Meeting was called to order at approximately 1pm ET on October 19, 2016.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Matthew Morikawa (Konica Document Systems)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)
Pete Zehler (Xerox)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Approve previous minutes
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20161005.pdf>
 - Approved as posted
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike/Smith)
 - IETF IPP/1.1 Updates (Mike/Ira)
 - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2910bis-10.txt>
 - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis-11.txt>
 - Changes for new IETF Proposed Standards
 - Alexey Melnikov (IETF ART AD) as AD sponsor on 06/02/16
 - RFC2910bis & RFC 2911bis - IETF Approved as Proposed Standards!
 - Waiting on RFC Editor AUTH-48 phase for several minor edits
 - Schedule: IPP/1.1 RFCs published in Q4 2016
 - IPP 3D Printing Extensions (Mike)
 - Prototype draft
 - Prototype experience pending from Apple, looks like the only change needed is to add the "color-supported" Printer Description attribute to tell a Client whether the Printer can reproduce colors other than the material color
 - Schedule: Stable draft in Q4 2016
4. Review of IPP Finishings 2.1 (Smith)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings21-20161018-rev.pdf>
 - Stable draft
 - IPP WG Last Call on 08/22/16 to 09/06/16
 - Schedule: PWG Call for Objections in Q4 2016

- Section 3.2.17:
 - Line 401: "she is notified that the number of staples in the Printer is low."
- Q: Do we want to provide guidance about where to put finisher supplies?
 - Some existing printers report staples in marker supplies (embedded stapler, just the one finisher)
 - A: Maybe add a note to the section on printer-finishers/-supplies about historical reporting of staples in the printer-supplies attribute. Printers ought to implement the Printer Finisher MIB and printer-finishers/-supplies attributes.
- Section 5.1.4:
 - Add a note about punch-multiple-xxx - 1 through 4 have explicit values.
- Section 5.2.5.4:
 - Remove spaces around = for media-size-name and folding
- Section 5.2.8:
 - Add reference to "job-media-sheets-supported" Printer Description attribute.
 - Line 1170: "and is only ALLOWED in ...", break first sentence into two.
 - Note: You don't specify media-sheets-supported of 0 to indicate that you don't support a finishing process. Use either job-constraints-supported (e.g., finishing process not supported for a specific media size) or omit the finishing value (i.e. finishing process not supported at all)
 - Change to "rangeOfInteger(1:MAX)"
 - Also change in RFC2911bis for job-media-sheets-supported
- Section 6.9:
 - Line 1425: Change to media-sheets-supported=1-100
 - Line 1437: Drop media-size-name for staple-top-left example (same offset for all sizes)
- Section 6.18:
 - Drop finDeviceAttributeTable and maxsetsheets (check that is all that was added since 2.0)
 - Make CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED based on implementation of Finishing MIB.
 - "Printers that support the IETF Finishing MIB MUST support this attribute."
 - Drop notes 2 and 3.
 - Table 2:
 - Drop REQUIRED conformance from finDeviceTable
 - Note 1: just finDeviceIndex (drop finDeviceTable)
- Section 6.18.3:
 - Line 1615: "a a"
- Section 6.19:
 - CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED like section 6.18
- Section 6.19.2:

- For second example, use "(de)" after quotes, e.g.:
 - "Hefter SN:BEISPIEL-12345"(de)
 - Section 6.20:
 - CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED is finSupplyTable is implemented:
 - "Printers that support the IETF Finishing MIB and finSupplyTable MUST support this attribute."
 - Section 6.20.1:
 - Line 1676: Fix table reference
 - Table 3:
 - ??? -> FinisherSupplies
 - FinisherType -> FinisherSupplyType
 - FinisherCapacityUnit -> FinisherSupplyCapacityUnit
 - Stretch first column to avoid wrapping "(note 2)"
 - Drop "OPTIONAL" from finSupplyTable (not mapped)
 - Comment SK2: Not an issue (just a textual representation of the MIB value)
 - Update note 1 to just talk about finSupplyIndex
 - Update note 2 - "a supply level condition" (not just low, empty, full, almost full, etc.)
 - Global: Fix ABNF: "[xxx-optional]" should be "*xxx-optional", "*xxx-required" should be "1*xxx-required"
 - Section 6.20.3:
 - Line 1777: Add trailing semicolon (inside quotes)
 - Section 6.21:
 - READ-ONLY? Look at whether this is a Printer Description or Printer Status attribute (that's what we do now)
 - Also update printer-finisher-description
 - CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED
 - Read-only in the MIB, these should be Printer Status attributes
 - Global: check all 6.x attributes are Printer Description or Printer Status as appropriate.
 - Section 6.21.2:
 - Title: "Example of printer-finisher-supplies-description"
 - Update second example, no serial numbers on staples.
5. Review of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
- <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippssystem10-20161018-rev.pdf>
 - Interim draft
 - Reviewed by IPP WG on 10/05/16
 - Stopped at end of section 6.1.5.1
 - Schedule: Prototype draft in Q4 2016 / Q1 2017
 - Resource State Diagram:
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/ipp-wg-agenda-november-16d1.pdf> (slide 24)
 - "Bad Resource Data" is confusing, maybe include note in diagram that lists reasons for an abort
 - Interrupted send-resource-data
 - Bad/unsupported data

- Unable to install
- Can add resource-state-reasons for this...
- Mike to send Ira a copy after making changes
- Did not review the document itself...

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference call November 2, 2016 at 1pm ET
- Action: Mike to send IANA IPP registry updates to Ira (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to add output-bin registration to IANA IPP registry (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to create an IPP Resource state diagram (DONE)
- Action: Mike to fix registration of job-constraints-supported and job-resolvers-supported to include "resolver-name (name(MAX))" member attribute (PENDING)