Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes
February 15, 2018

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3pm ET on February 15, 2018.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
   - IP policy accepted, Smith taking minutes
2. Review previous minutes
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20180201.pdf
   - Approved as posted
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20180207.pdf
   - Approved as posted
3. Status of Open Printing WG GSoC 2018 (Ira)
   - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2017/019463.html
   - DONE - 4 January to 23 January - Mentor organization applications
   - DONE - 23 January - 11 February - GSoC reviews mentor org applications
   - DONE - 12 February - GSoC approves mentoring organizations
   - 12 February to 12 March - Students discuss GSoC projects
   - 12 to 27 March - Students apply for GSoC projects
   - 14 project ideas - 30+ first cut student candidates
   - Primary need is mentor volunteers - IPP WG contributors?
   - One project lost its student - IPP System Service ipptool test files
4. Status of AMSC and ISO liaisons w/ PWG (Paul)
   - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20180201.htm
   - See PWG SC minutes of 02/01/18
5. Status of Welcome to Printing with IPP (Mike)
   - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20180207.pdf
   - IPP WG edits during PWG Virtual F2F on 02/07/18
   - Schedule - TBD
6. Registration of 'subunit-cooling-down' Printer Status (Smith)
   - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019504.html
   - No objections, approved
   - Will be included in today's IANA IPP registry update
7. EU General Data Protection (GDPR) info (Ira)

- http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019503.html
- Discuss impact on IPP (protocol and usage)
- Need to make sure mailing lists make it clear they operate under the PWG IP policy
- GDPR FAQs point out that we should have a privacy policy URI attribute (for informed and explicit consent)
- Recent survey shows that more users care about security/privacy than convenience
    - https://www.techrepublic.com/article/ibm-security-report-security-now-outweighs-convenience/
8. Status of IPP HTTP Authentication whitepaper (Smith)
    - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/whitepaper/tb-ippauth-20180123-rev.pdf
    - Interim draft - PWG Virtual F2F review on 02/08/18
    - Schedule - TBD
9. Status of Job Save Password (Smith)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/whitepaper/tb-savepassword-20180205-rev.pdf
    - Interim draft - PWG Virtual F2F review on 02/07/18
    - Schedule - TBD
10. Status of IPP Document Encryption (Smith)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/whitepaper/tb-doccrypt-20180205.pdf
    - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019497.html
    - Initial draft - PWG Virtual F2F review on 02/07/18
    - Schedule - TBD
11. Status of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20180214-rev.pdf
    - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019475.html
    - Prototype draft - PWG Virtual F2F review on 02/07/18
    - Schedule - prototype in "ippserver" - Stable draft in Q2/Q3 2018
12. Review of IPP Private Attributes (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippprivacy10-20180207.pdf
    - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019499.html
    - Initial draft - PWG Virtual F2F discussion on 02/08/18
    - Title: Change to "IPP Privacy Attributes v1.0 (PRIVACY)"
    - Abstract: Mention Printer privacy policy attribute
    - Q: Should we keep these attributes read-only?
        - If the purpose is to prevent admins from seeing private values, then no.
        - Just out-of-band (typically a config file or GUI), which means admin (locally)
        - A: Make them Description attributes (potentially settable), document security considerations, recommend against simple plain-text files
    - Section 1:
        - Rewrite as Printer Description attributes, potentially settable using Set-Printer-Attributes.
    - Section 3.1: complete this

- Section 4.1: Printer Description Attributes
- Section 4.1.1, 4.1.3, 4.1.5:
    - "xxx-private-access" -> "xxx-privacy-scope"
    - User (capitalized term)
    - "specifies which CLASSES of Users"
    - Say a few words about "none", put none at the end (most restrictive)
    - "keywords are defined from the least to the most restricted permitted Users"
- Section 4.1.2, 4.1.4, 4.1.6:
    - "xxx-private-attributes" -> "xxx-privacy-attributes"
    - Line 136: Missing quote after "document-description"
- New Section 4.1.7: "printer-privacy-policy-uri (uri)"
    - This REQUIRED attribute specifies a URL providing the Printer's privacy policy.
    - Talk about GDPR/others maybe for recommendations on content - talk about what attributes are used for during printing, whether the data leaves the printer, etc.
- Section 7:
    - Make it clear that Set-Printer-Attributes should be appropriately restricted, only authorized admins, etc.
    - Configuration values and job history should be protected at rest
- Section 8.1:
    - Printer Description, not Status
    - Add "printer-privacy-policy-uri" attribute
    - Rename other attributes accordingly.
- Section 8.2:
    - Rename attributes accordingly
- Think about adding these to System Service (for Resources, Subscriptions, defaults for Documents and Jobs)
    - xxx-private-scope-default, xxx-private-attributes-default for created printers
13. IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification 1.0 Update 3?
    - Goals:
        - Fix MSI package (release, not development DLLs - Issue #23)
        - New ippfind and ipptool binaries from ippsample to address regex name bug (Issue #22)
    - Action: Mike to update ippeveselfcert project with new ipptool/ippfind software/fixes
14. Review of IPP Everywhere 1.1 (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeve11-20180209-rev.pdf
    - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019501.html
    - Initial draft - 02/09/18
    - Did not get to this

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP WG conference call on Thursday, March 1 from 3:00-4:30pm ET
- Action: Mike to update ippeveselfcert project with new ipptool/ippfind software/fixes
- Action: Smith to follow-up on the 3MF liaison agreement (IN PROGRESS - query sent, awaiting reply)
- Action: Mike to post initial draft of IPP Privacy Attributes based on CUPS policy settings (DONE)
- Action: Smith to incorporate document encryption contents into new IPP Encrypted Jobs and Documents (TRUSTNOONE) registration document (IN PROGRESS - now using proper template, posting soon)
- Action: Mike to post initial draft of IPP Everywhere v1.1 (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post IPP GUPA registrations to IANA IPP registry (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post IPP Presets registrations to IANA IPP registry (DONE)
- Action: Mike/Ira to request IESG change of status for RFC 8010/8011 to Internet Standard (PENDING - after IETF 101)
- Action: Mike to document ippserver setup on Raspberry Pi for 3D (IN PROGRESS - close to wrapping it up)