Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes
January 17, 2019

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3pm ET on January 17, 2019.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Uli Wehner (Ricoh)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
   - http://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf
   - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Approve previous minutes
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20181206.pdf
   - Approved as posted
3. Status of various IPP mailing list notes
   - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019830.html
     - Canonical IPP way to set job-sheets to different tray/medium (pipitas)
     - job-sheets-col from 5100.3 can do it, CUPS doesn't yet support it, bug filed against CUPS
     - Deferring any discussion of defining banner file formats, etc.
   - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2018/019848.html
     - Registration for 'media-drying' keyword for "printer-state-reasons" (Smith)
     - Replaces previous request for 'marker-ink-drying'
     - Approved
     - Action: Mike to post approval of media-drying keyword, queue up for registry update
   - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019860.html
     - Report on Wireshark IPPS issues (Mike)
4. Status of AMSC and ISO liaisons w/ PWG (Paul)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20181105.htm
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20181217.htm
   - See PWG SC minutes from 5 November 2018
   - See PWG SC minutes from 17 December 2018

5. Review of IPP Authentication Methods (Smith)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippauth-20190116-rev.pdf
   - Prototype draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
   - IPP WG consensus to publish as PWG Best Practice
   - Section 4.4: Use could instead of might on line 274
   - Section 4.6: Add reference to RFC 8414 - OAuth 2.0 Authorization Server Metadata
      - Replace first sentence with "The 'oauth' IPP Authentication method uses:"
      - Bullet: "The OAuth2 Authentication Scheme [RFC6749] which provides ...;"
      - Bullet: "The OAuth2 Bearer Token [RFC6750] which provides ...; and"
      - Bullet: "The OAuth 2.0 Authorization Server Metadata [RFC8414] which provides the necessary metadata for interoperability."
   - Section 5.1.3:
      - "SHOULD abandon" instead of "cease".
   - Section 5.1.4:
      - Reword: *might* support Resource Owner Grants (username and password), but reference Proof Key for Code Exchange by OAuth Public Clients [RFC7636] and OAuth 2.0 for Native Apps [RFC8252] for native applications and OAuth 2.0 Security Best Practices (https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-ietf-oauth-security-topics) for general security requirements.
   - Section 5.2.5: Reword to reference best practices draft
   - References: switch from www.ietf.org/rfc/rfcNNNN.txt to tools.ietf.org/html/rfcNNNN
   - Global: "might"/"may" -> "could"
   - Next draft should be Stable
   - Smith will post a stable draft and start an IPP WG last call to end on Jan 31, 2019
   - Goal is to start the PWG Last Call before the February 2019 F2F.
   - Schedule - PWG Last Call Q1 2019
6. Review of IPP 3D Printing Extensions v1.1 (Mike)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipp3d11-20190114-rev.pdf
   - Prototype draft - PWG F2F discussion in November 2018
      - Change list notes change of status to "stable" but cover page doesn't reflect that
   - Fix status to stable, hold off until Jan 31 meeting to possibly get concrete material-type values from Paul
   - Schedule - PWG Call for Objections Q1 2019
7. Review of Safe G-Code (Mike)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-pwgsafegcode10-20190114-rev.pdf
   - Stable draft - PWG F2F discussion in November 2018
   - IPP WG consensus to publish as PWG Best Practice
   - Add version number to page headings
   - Mike will post an updated stable draft and start an IPP WG last call ending

Jan 31, 2019
- Schedule - PWG WG Last Call Q1 2019
8. Review of How to Print Using the IPP (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippguide-20190111.html
    - https://github.com/istopwg/pwg-books
    - Stable draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Approved with Smith's editorial changes.
    - Schedule - Publication in Q1 2019
9. Review of IPP Everywhere 1.1 (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeve11-20180926-rev.pdf
    - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019856.html
    - http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019857.html
    - Prototype draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Summary of IPP Everywhere 1.1 changes in January 2019
    - Recommended Attributes/Specs for IPP Everywhere 1.1 in January 2019
    - Consensus is to add content as proposed.
    - Next status stable
    - Hold off on IPP WG last call until self-cert is finalized.
    - Schedule - PWG Call for Objections Q1 2019
10. Status of IPP Everywhere 1.1 Self-Certification Manual 1.1 (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert11-20180704-rev.pdf
    - Prototype draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Schedule - PWG Call for Objections Q1 2019
    - Tool updates needed for new operations, any web site changes
11. Status of Job and Printer Extensions v2 (Smith)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippjobprinterext2v20-20180904.docx
    - https://ftp.pwg.org//pub/pwg/ipp/slides/IPP-Job-Storage-v2-20181116.pdf
    - Initial draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Schedule - Prototype draft Q2 2019
12. Status of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20180701-rev.pdf
    - Prototype draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Prototyping tasks being tracked as a Github project in "ippserver"
    - Schedule - Stable draft in Q1 2019
13. Status of PWG Printer MIB and IPP MFD Alerts 1.1 (Ira)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-pwgmfdalerts11-20181228-rev.pdf
    - Interim draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Schedule - Prototype draft Q2 2019
14. Status of IPP Document Object v1.1 (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippdocobject11-20181022.pdf
    - Interim draft - PWG F2F review in November 2018
    - Prototyping tasks being tracked as a Github project in "ippserver"
    - Schedule - Stable draft in Q1 2019
15. Status of IPP Job Extensions v1.1 (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippjobext11-20181023-rev.pdf
    - Interim draft - PWG F2F discussion in November 2018

- Schedule - Stable draft Q1 2019
16. Status of IPP Encrypted Jobs and Documents (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipptrustnoone10-20180328-rev.pdf
    - Interim draft - PWG F2F discussion in November 2018
    - Good news - PGP-based path forward!
    - Schedule - Prototype draft Q2 2019
17. Open Printing update (Ira)
    - OP monthly call (01/09/19)
    - OP renovation progress using Jekyll (instead of WordPress)
    - GSoC 2019 Linux Foundation mentor application (01/16/19)
    - GSoC 2019 OP projects edits close (02/06/19)

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference call on January 31, 2019 and February 28, 2019 at 3pm ET
- IPP F2F session on February 13/14, 2019
- Action: Mike to post job-cancel-after proposal to IPP mailing list (DONE)
- Action: Mike to publish How to Print using the IPP (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post summary of proposed IPP Everywhere 1.1 spec changes (DONE)
- Action: Paul to get a list of common concrete standards that can be shown as example material-type values, maybe other environmental values? (IN PROGRESS - Paul collecting information)
- Action: Paul/Smith to determine whether ISTO needs to do anything to participate in ISO SG12 (IN PROGRESS - waiting on INCITS)
- Action: Mike to investigate IPPS issue in Wireshark - "ipp" filter not working (DONE)
- Action: Smith to follow-up on the 3MF liaison agreement (IN PROGRESS - coordinating with 3MF liaison)