

# Internet Printing Protocol Meeting Minutes

## April 13, 2023

Meeting was called to order at 3pm EST.

### Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)  
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark)  
Ira McDonald (High North)  
Piotr Pawliczek (Google)  
Anthony Suarez (Kyocera)  
Michael Sweet (Lakeside Robotics)  
Bill Wagner (TIC)  
Uli Wehner (Ricoh)  
Steven Young (Canon)

### Agenda Items

1. Antitrust and IP policies, minute taker
  - [https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership\\_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf](https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf)
  - [https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership\\_docs/pwg-antitrust-policy.pdf](https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-antitrust-policy.pdf)
  - Antitrust and IP policies accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. IPP minutes from previous meetings
  - <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20230330.pdf>
  - Approved as posted
3. Status of AMSC and ISO liaisons w/ PWG (Paul)
  - <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20230123.htm>
  - <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20230306.htm>
  - <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20230320.htm>
  - See PWG Steering Committee minutes from 01/23/23, 03/06/23, 03/20/23
4. OAuth2 - discussion (Benjamin, Piotr, Mike, Smith)
  - Update on Trust Relationships posted on 04/11/23 (Smith)
    - <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/OAuth-2.0-Trust-Relationships-and-Resource-Identifiers-2023-04-11.pdf> (Trust Relationships slides)
  - <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippoauth10-20230310.pdf> (IPP OAuth)
  - Discussion at IPP WG on 02/16/23, 03/02/23, 03/30/23
  - First draft of IPP OAuth Extensions v1.0 posted on 03/10/23 (Mike)
  - Reviewed on 03/30/23 - stopped at end of section 4.1.1
  - Section 4.1.1:
    - Reword second sentence to get rid of "you get from"
    - Reword second paragraph to be more clear, less passive, less

- negative requirements?
  - Focus is on not just using any auth server URI
  - Purpose is to prevent phishing attacks
  - Mention something about federated services being out of scope (federation protocols make sure first URI only links to other trusted auth services)
  - Maybe talk about enterprise (DNS-SD/DHCP-discovered) vs. home (well-known public AUTHZ)
  - Make sure all URI and X.509 references have explicit context
- Section 4.1.2:
  - Reword this as a list of steps
- Section 4.1.3:
  - Reword "you get" - "received"?
  - Add reference to UTA RFC (which covers how to validate certificates)
  - Update to note that Client/Proxy might reevaluate certificate after discovering that OAuth is in use
  - Smith: Still don't want to give up TOFU, use JWE/fingerprinting
    - Mike: My concern is that JWE or fingerprinting require Auth Server changes, while local certificate servers are already a thing for enterprise networks, IoT ACME can support home networks too
  - Ira: Add reference to latest OAuth Best Practices
- Section 4.2:
  - Remove RAR
  - Expand conformance paragraph and talk about Printer/System validation of the access token with references
- Section 4.3:
  - "End User's access token"
  - "OAuth 2.0 access tokens can be cached and reused ..."
  - Smith: What about sharing tokens between devices?
    - Mike: Possible, out of scope and we don't care here I think
  - "the Client caches the End User's access token and the Printer/System access token separately."
- Section 5:
  - Remove note
- Sections 5.1.1/5.1.2: Remove
- Section 5.1.3:
  - Add special case for "openid" scope name for OpenID Connect
  - Piotr: Does Printer/System know what kind of OAuth server it is connected to?
    - Mike: Printer/System gets the list of scopes from the server metadata, knows what kind of server based on metadata path
- Section 6:
  - Drop note
- Add to section 4 discussion of Client/Proxy discovering OAuth and how to

- choose a URI
- Section 7.1.x: Client Registration
- Section 7.2.x: Device Registration
- Section 7.2.3: Scopes/token exchange
- Section 7.x: Keep generic and don't focus on specific implementations (e.g. ActiveDirect vs. enterprise services)
- Section 9.3:
  - Make certificate server references more generic
- Add conformance section
- Finished review of this document

## **Next Steps / Open Actions**

- Review F2F and OAuth slides at next concall
- Next conference calls on April 27 and May 11, 2023 at 3pm
- Action: Mike to update WD templates to use "Security and Privacy Considerations" (PENDING)
- Action: Smith to create IPP Everywhere 2.0 slides showing changes (PENDING - started on it)
- Action: Mike to update IPP Everywhere 2.0 test files (PENDING)