

Internet Printing Protocol WG Minutes

October 22 and 23, 2013

Meeting was called to order at approximately 11:00am PT October 22, 2013 and 1:30pm PT October 23, 2013.

Attendees

Russell Brudnicki (Kyocera Document Solutions)
Bill Garvis (Conexant Systems Inc.)
Gale Giansiracusa (Kyocera Document Solutions)
G. Gupta (Oki Data)
Dr. Ashlee Holbrook (Lexmark)
Smith Kennedy (HP)
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark - call in)
Daniel Manchala (Xerox - call in)
Tim McCann (Konica Minolta)
Phil Mccoog (HP)
Ira McDonald (High North - call in)
Joe Murdock (Sharp)
Ron Nevo (Samsung - call in)
Roarke Randall (Toshiba)
Norbert Schade (Conexant Systems Inc.)
Tak Shiozacki (Epson)
Brian Smithson (Ricoh)
Glen Stone (Samsung)
Jon Super (Conexant Systems Inc.)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS - call in)
William Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)
Pete Zehler (Xerox - call in)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Discussion
 - a. Approved combination of IPP Everywhere self-cert with interoperability
 - b. Advancing to full standard
 - Just to IPP/2.0 SE as a test case after IPP Finishings 2.0 is completed
 - IPP Everywhere after that
 - What about document references? Include current and any later versions of documents

- Ira will check with IETF about advancing IPP/1.1 to full standard after IPP/2.0 is advanced
3. Review of IPP Everywhere Self-Certification Manual 1.0
 - a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20131014-rev.pdf>
 - b. Table 1:
 - Make all TLS items 5.x sub-tests
 - c. 5.x: For 2.0 consider references BCD and other development tools
 - d. Section 6:
 - What to do for tests? Just have a check box (“yes I did it”)
 - Action: Mike/Ira to ask Microsoft for WS-Discovery test script
 - Clarify differences with Bonjour re: TLS support (no separate registration)
 - Action: Mike to ask Justin about WS-Discovery probe response example
 - IBM open source WS-i tool?
 - Action: Ira to ask OpenPrinting about writing WS-Discovery tool
 - e. General: Need to say something about using production firmware (not certification/test/debug firmware)
 - Check box for “yes I used production firmware”
 - f. Section 7:
 - Can't do other faults - how to force a jam
 - Consider further error reporting tests for 2.0
 - Supply level tests
 - Consider for 2.0
 - g. Section 8:
 - Reduce to a few jobs - single page, multi page, highest, lowest, JPEG, PDF
 - So some simple combinations: page-ranges=3-3 + copies=2 for PDF, print-color-mode for grayscale or color output
 - Check box for “yes all output was correct”
 - Include figures showing expected output
 - h. Section 9:
 - Work with ISTO to define legal requirements
 4. Review of IPP Implementors Guide v2.0
 - a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippig20-20131002-rev.pdf>
 - b. Q: What happens if you do a Create-Job followed by a failed Send-Document?
 - A: Job is still open (even if last-document is true in the Send-Document request)
 - If a client has a failed Send-Document, best practice is to do a Close-Job or Cancel-Job to clean things up (don't wait for the multiple operation timeout)
 - c. Q: What about getting -supported, -ready, and -default values for a given user?
 - A: Proposed new operation called Get-User-Supported-Values, Get-Printer-User-Attributes, ???
 - Document that Get-User-Supported-Values operation usually

- requires authentication
 - Best practice is for Client to look for operation in operations-supported and issue subsequent Get-User-Supported-Values request to get values for UI
 - New “IPP Policy-Based Printing Extensions” or something like that
 - Don’t add anything for operations-supported - authenticated user is not enough context for most operations, and changing UI based on access can be confusing since you can authenticate as a different user...
- d. Section 4.3:
- BEST -> BETTER
 - New BEST uses Get-User-Supported-Values operation
- e. Section 4.4:
- Talk about -actual attributes not being stable until the job reaches a terminating state - can be used to show current assignments/ receipt for job but may be updated as the job is processed
 - Add discussion of what to do for a failed Send-Document
- f. Section 4.5:
- Best practice for clients - should ensure that URIs are stable for life of job
- g. Section 4.8:
- Add note here for BEST: Printer MAY return affected attributes, e.g. printer-supply, printer-input-tray, printer-output-tray, etc.
- h. Add new printer recommendation section on notifications
- Printer MAY include additional Printer attributes in event notifications, e.g. printer-supply when toner is low, printer-input-tray when media is low, etc.
 - Client MAY also request a list of attributes (via notify-attributes attribute)
 - if attributes are provided in event notification, no follow-up Get-Printer-Attributes request needs to be done.
- i. Section 5.1: Reword, Client cannot “bear in mind”, “to consider that ...”
- j. Section 5.2:
- Warn against use of application/octet-stream (unreliable, etc.)
 - Require printers to report at least one format other than application/octet-stream (even a vendor type)
- k. Global: Fix all usage of should, must, may, etc. to be ALL CAPS
- l. Global: Fix all IPP Server -> IPP Printer
- m. Section 5.3:
- Reference media-xxx attributes in 5.8.x
- n. Section 5.4:
- Revisit when IPP Finishings 2.0 gets another review
 - “other rich JOB ticket formats”
 - Use finishings-col when supported, otherwise use finishings
 - finishings only provides coarse controls, finishings-col allows for fine control
- o. Section 5.5:

- Line 931: "print EXACTLY as requested"
 - Separate pdl-override-supported from other two attributes (client determines whether fidelity is supported)
 - Delete lines 968-974 (duplicate of first two bullets)
- p. Section 5.6:
- Talk about history of sheet-collate and multiple-document-handling, recommend use of multiple-document-handling even for single document jobs
 - First paragraph: clients use multiple-document-handling for collated copies
 - Second paragraph: history/reasoning
- q. Add other terminology - Job, Document, etc. from JPS3/2911/3995
- r. Section 5.8:
- Add xxx-ready and xxx-default, media-col-database
 - Make 5.8.x subheadings for each of the attributes
- s. Section 5.9:
- Break into separate sections: Printer Status and Notifications, Job ..., Document ...
- t. Section 6: "IPP Printer Best Practices"
- u. Global: client -> Client, printer -> Printer
- v. Stopped at section 7
5. System Control Service discussion
- a. Enable-Printers -> Enable-System-Services, etc.
 - b. Add aliases for Printer operations to use "Service"
 - c. system-uri-supported, or just system-xri-supported?
 - d. Layering:
 - IPP System
 - IPP Server
 - System Control Service
 - e. Targets:
 - system-uri for system object/service
 - scanner-uri for scanner service
 - f. Attribute groups:
 - Add system group
 - Alias scanner to printer group
 - g. Q: Do we want to do startup or shutdown services in 1.0?
 - A: No, remove for 1.0 since we have no way to create services
 - h. SM Shutdown services can be restarted???
 - i. Keep scan in mind as well
6. Next Steps
- a. Pete Zehler has volunteered to do IPP Scan
 - Once scan is done/close to done, start IPP Multifunction
 - b. What about total work counters?
 - Can't break it down by service type
 - Need to query counters for each service
 - Needs further discussion

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference call is November 4, 2013 at 3pm ET
- Continue reviewing updated IIG2
- Action: Mike/Ira to ask Microsoft for WS-Discovery test script
- Action: Mike to ask Justin about WS-Discovery probe response example
- Action: Ira to ask OpenPrinting about writing WS-Discovery tool
- Action: Ira/Paul/SM workgroup to review values of finishings-col member attributes to make sure we have parity with common JDF values (PENDING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to make sure finishing MIB and Finishings 2.0 are in sync (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to send Ira a copy of the prtInputType registration that was done in the Printer MIB (DONE)
- Action: Mike to update IPPSIX to include device-name/uuid as a potential operation attribute for Identify-Printer (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to post PWG Formal Vote of IPP Transaction-Based Printing Extensions (DONE)
- Action: Ira/Joe to issue errata on IDS Attributes for multi-valued FirmwarePatches (ONGOING)
- Action: Mike to add spec best-practices to WD template (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to add finishing-template-supported (1setOf name(MAX)) Printer attribute to IANA registry (PENDING)
- Action: Ira to capture job terminating state wording from IPP FaxOut for SM FaxIn (DONE - part of SM 3.0)
- Action: Ira and Mike to review 5100.x specs to remove action items, fix boilerplate copyright text in early specs, fix header/footer/document titles as needed, and fix normative references to drafts, etc. (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to work with IANA to update registry to include a "set allowed" column for attributes and improve the plain text formatting (ONGOING - moving read-only attributes to new groups in IANA registry)
- Action: Paul to reach out to label/portable printer vendors to join IPP WG discussions (ONGOING - Paul to send out list before October 2013 F2F)