Internet Printing Protocol WG Minutes
May 13, 2014

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm PT May 13, 2014.

Attendees

Russell Brudnicki (Kyocera Document Solutions)
Daniel Dressler (call in)
Haisong Gu (Konica Minolta)
Smith Kennedy (HP)
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark)
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)
Ira McDonald (High North - call in)
Peter Michelak (Shinesoft)
Yoshi Murakami (Epson)
Joe Murdock (Sharp)
James Nakatsu (Epson)
Ron Nevo (Samsung - call in)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS - call in)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)
Pete Zehler (Xerox - call in)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
   a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Media sizes:
   a. DSC photo is a 4:3 aspect ratio size: om_dsc-photo_89x119mm
   b. Card is: iso_id-1_53.98x85.6mm, also add other ISO card sizes
   c. MSN20: is it missing the Photo L size in table 6? oe_photo-l_3.5x5in
   d. Action: Mike to post media size summary to IPP and add to registry
3. Extending printer-output-tray
   a. No objections to extending
   b. Also for printer-input-tray?
   c. May printer-supply?
   d. White paper to define extension point in ABNF if we don't cover all MIB properties
   e. Action: Smith to create white paper for extension to printer-output-tray, printer-input-tray, and printer-supply
4. Review IPP Implementor's Guide 2.0
   a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippig20-20140513-rev.pdf
   b. Started at section 5

c. Section 5:
    -   Title: "Supplying and Evaluating IPP Attributes"
    -   Mention this is best practice for the Client
d. Section 5.1:
    -   Maybe move later in the section
    -   Job Template Attribute Defaults and Capabilities
    -   Reword: Always send and don't default - lines 945-953
    -   "copies" not a good example since it can be simulated in software; try "staple" or something
e. Section 5.1.2:
    -   Line 963: A Printer MUST bind default values to the Job's attributes at Job Processing time.
    -   Line 965: not a response attribute, a Job Status attribute
f. Section 5.2:
    -   Line 977: Drop "For this reason" stuff
g. Section 5.2.1:
    -   Drop last sentence
h. Section 5.2.2:
    -   Just sentence 2. Drop all SHOULD NOTs.
    -   Line 992-996: Printers SHOULD set the "document-format-actual" Job Status attribute to report the detected MIME media type.
i. Section 5.3:
    -   Line 998: Given a Printer that supports...
    -   Line 999: SHOULD supply the "media-col" attribute ...
    -   Line 1001: "job-sheets-col", check others (some have simple and collection versions)
    -   Avoid passive "This is true for" wording
    -   Rearrange first paragraph to be 5.3.1 Client Recommendations, second paragraph is the lead-in for 5.3, and the third paragraph is 5.3.2 Printer Recommendations
    -   Line 1004: media-col.media-size member attribute
    -   Title: "Supply "media-col" Attribute"
    -   Line 1008: Drop "(1-3 units)"
    -   Line 1003: Add examples (", e.g., size, source, and type.")
    -   Line 1006: Include example of #10 envelope and 4.125" width conversion to hundredths of millimeters.
    -   Line 1007: Drop "even"
    -   Client recommendation: when converting to media-size units, SHOULD truncate fractional portion of media-size (add reference to MSN20)
    -   Printer recommendation: allow small inaccuracy.
j. Section 5.4:
    -   "Supply "finishings-col" Attribute"
    -   Add rationale
    -   Client recommendation is "SHOULD use finishings-col if supported"
    -   Printer recommendation is "SHOULD support FIN2 and finishings-col"

      k.   Section 5.5
- Title: "Enforcing Job Ticket Fidelity"
- Make attributes use actual list paragraph style (indented)
- Line 1022: Don't uppercase exactly
- Lines 1021-1023: Reword and provide examples - web page vs. check printing
- Line 1035: Additionally, a Client use use the "pdl-override-supported" attribute ...
- Line 1037: No need to make it a list
- Line 1038: "with IPP Job Template or Document Template attributes"

      l.   Section 5.5.1:
- Numbered list
- "a Client SHOULD:"
- reword bullets as continuations of "a Client SHOULD"
- break last bullet into two

      m. Section 5.5.2:
- Numbered list
- "A Printer SHOULD:"
- 1055: for JPEG, PWG Raster Format, and (if supported) PDF document formats

      n.   Section 5.6:
- Add 5.6.1 and 5.6.2
- A Client SHOULD supply "multiple-document-handling" with value 'separate-documents-collated-copies' to produce collated copies.
- A Printer that supports "copies" SHOULD support "multiple-document-handling" with value 'separate-documents-collated-copies' to produce collated copies.

      o.   Section 5.7:
- Reorder, add 5.7.1, 5.7.2

      p.   Global: Attributes in double quotes, values in single quotes

      q.   Global: Job, Job Creation, Job Template, Job Description, Printer, etc. are capitalized terms

      r.   Global: Check for use of "object" - drop if preceded by Printer or Job or Document

      s.   Stopped at 5.8

5.   Start of Thursday
      a.   Discussion of potential issues WRT client expectations
- Q: Is there a way to detect client OS/print stack?
  - A: Not reliably, don't do it
- Q: Is it an error if a printer rejects a client request because a client doesn't include a new attribute?
  - A: Generally yes. For Job Template attributes a printer can only reject if the attribute is listed in printer-mandatory-job-attributes
  - Probably good to say "don't do this" in the implementors guide for any job template attributes that can be defaulted

6. Review IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification
   a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20140509-rev.pdf
   b. Section 1:
      - Mention product family vs. printer/model
   c. Section 1.1:
      - Forward references to product family definition
      - Item 3: "because WS-Discovery" instead of "as", put the Because at front
      - Item 4: "This manual DEFINES tests FOR the ...", "Bonjour (DNS-SD and mDNS)"
      - Item 5: "This manual defines only one"
      - Item 7: "Printer self-certification for a Product Family should be performed using the most fully featured model of the Product Family."
      - Item 8: "A vendor can request ..."
      - Item 9: Split into two items, "A vendor is not required to certify an already certified Product Family against ..."
      - Item 10: "and will be approved and ..."
      - Item 11: "When necessary, the chosen PWG review members may present exception requests in anonymized form to the PWG Steering Committee for wider discussion."
      - Item 13: you -> vendor
      - Item 14: "Once approved, the Printers in the certified Product Family will be listed ...", drop product family, model (singular)
   d. Section 1.2:
      - might instead of may
      - would instead of will
      - is -> will be
      - changes will go through
      - will include time
   e. Section 1.3:
      - "Developers and vendors can report problems ...."
      - State this is a public database. Anonymous reporting process... etc.
   f. Section 2.3:
      - "A group of products from a common product platform."
      - Add examples of OEM products, servers, etc., info reference to business dictionary.com
      - Q: What about OEMs, not wanting to expose OEM relationship?
        - A: Just have OEM submit results for OEM products
        - Products are listed separately.
   g. Section 3.2.1: fix typos
   h. Section 3.3: Fix typos
   i. Section 3.4: Fix numbering, "and Recommendations"
   j. Section 4.1:
      - "The Printer in the Product Family ..."
   k. Section 4.5:
      - Wrong email, should be ippEVEselfcert@pwg.org

       l.   Table 3:
- Deflate and gzip, if supported
- Don't forget to prompt for media

      m. Section 7.3:
- Vendors do not submit hardcopy output ...
- Add figures containing document images
- Say something about clipping

      n. Section 8.1:
- You -> vendor
- Submission -> self-certification

      o. Section 8.2:
- Make and Model, not just model
- software and firmware
- two PWG member representatives
- Reword 514-515 to avoid passive voice and mention web server or something

      p. Section 8.3:
- will include, etc.
- submitter can correct or give up
- the web site will inform the submitter of the reviewers' decisions.

      q. Section 8.4:
- The PWG will grant exceptions ....
- List of potential exceptions

      r. Exceptions to allow:
- Media Empty test (no media presence sensors)
- Printer supplies test (thermal label printers)

7. Review IPP Scan
    a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippscan10-20140509-rev.pdf
    b. Amend WG last call message with end date
    c. Line 744: "destination-attributes" (hyphen, in quotes)
    d. Date in heading is messed up
    e. Will resolve -date-time attribute comments on the IPP list
    f. Review updated draft at June 2 meeting
    g. PWG Last Call starting mid-June, pending SC approval
8. Review IPP Finishings 2.0
    a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings20-20140509-rev.pdf
    b. Section 4: Add figure showing coordinate systems and locations of staples, holes, etc.
    c. 5.2.4.2: Remove editor's note (no coating-color)
    d. 5.2.7.2: Remove editor's note (no laminating-color), coating->lamination
    e. Add 5.2.9.4: Examples showing standard staple values for each enum
9. Review IPP Shared Infrastructure Extensions
    a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsix10-20140226.pdf
    b. Did not get to this.

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference calls June 2 and June 16, 2014 at 3pm ET
- Action: Mike to post media size summary to IPP and add to registry
- Action: Smith to create white paper for extension to printer-output-tray, printer-input-tray, and printer-supply
- Action: Mike to post draft slides for F2F (DONE)
- Action: Mike to produce stable draft of IPP FaxOut with flash character for PWG Call for Objections (DONE)
- Action: Mike to release a prototype draft of FIN2 (DONE)
- Action: Ira to add comments to Printer MIB for fax-modem-protocol-error and xxx-recoverable-storage-error - suffix dropped from IPP keyword with corresponding suffix (-error, -report, -warning) added depending on the printer state. (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to submit IANA registration for IPP printer-state-reasons updates for fax-modem-protocol and xxx-recoverable-storage (PENDING)
- Action: Ira to submit Printer MIB registration for new xxx-missing PrtAlertCodeTC values (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to propose an approach for deprecation of IPP attributes and values in the IANA registry (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira/Paul/SM workgroup to review values of finishings-col member attributes to make sure we have parity with common JDF values (PENDING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to make sure finishing MIB and Finishings 2.0 are in sync (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to add spec best-practices to WD template, fix abstract wording (PENDING)