Attendees:

Nancy Chen,	Oki Data
Ira McDonald,	High North
Andrew Mitchell	HP
Bill Wagner,	TIC
Peter Zehler	Xerox

1. **Identify Minute Taker** – Nancy Chen

2. **PWG Process**
   Attendees were informed that the meeting is held in accord with the PWG Intellectual Property Policy. There was no objection.

3. **Approval of Minutes**
   The last teleconference meeting minutes: ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/minutes/pwg-ftf-mfd-minutes-20101104.pdf was accepted.

4. **Agenda bashing**
   1. Identify Minute Taker
   2. Approval of minutes from October Face-to-face meeting
   ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/minutes/pwg-ftf-mfd-minutes-20101104.pdf
   3. Agenda bashing

   4. Discuss current issues with MFD model (See below)

   5. Discuss outstanding Overall Specification issues.

   6. Discuss the suggested Security Considerations by Nancy
   <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/wd/Suggested-text-for-Security-Considerations-for-MFD-Model-and-Common-Semantics-20101117.pdf   >

   5. Next steps

   No objection to the agenda.

5. **Discuss current issues with MFD model**
   1) Scan Job Status, EmailOut Job Status, FaxOut Job Status, have both ImagesCompleted and the full set of <Service>JobCounters which includes several Images counters. Print Job Status, Copy Job Status, FaxIn Job Status and EmailIn Job Status do not include an impressions completed, but do include the <Service>JobCounters

   Agreed:

- PrintJobStatus does include ImpressionsCompleted. Copy should as well. EmailIn and FaxIn may need ImagesCompleted since the processing of a job may not result in hard copy out. Those jobs always accept some number of images.

- FaxIn, EmailIn and FaxOut should have ImagesCompleted. Anything with hardcopy out should have ImpressionsCompleted. Hence Copy and Print Job Status should have ImpressionsCompleted. In addition to Imagescompleted, FaxIn and EmailIn Job Status may have ImpressionsCompleted too if they do hardcopy output. Every Service should have ImagesCompleted except for Copy and Print which have ImpressionsCompleted.

AI: Pete to fix various Job Status elements to include ImagesCompleted that is missing currently.

2) Are the Service Elements the same counters as Job oriented counter values or are they separate?   If they are separate, does persistence have any significance?

<PZ>Job counters have a scope of a single job. Service counters have a scope of all the jobs processed by the service. At this time all service/job related counters share a common data type. The recent change to accommodate persistence had a side effect I missed. The resolution is either to redefine the job level counters or to mandate a lifetime value for the persistence. I prefer the former resolution. Another side effect is that Job counters have counts only applicable to a service (i.e., Availability, Monitoring). I believe the data types for the Job/Document counters needs to be corrected. It should be discussed next week at the MFD meeting.</PZ>

Agreed:
- "Persistence" attribute for any CounterEntry should be eliminated. All counters including System, Subunit, Service, Job, Document counters should be lifetime counters only. The recent change to include "Persistence" was to follow the PWG Counter spec, though Counter spec only requires "lifetime" counters, and allows other persistence. If a vendor is interested in adding other persistence counters, vendor's extension point can be added.

AI: Peter to remove "Persistence" attribute from all counter entries and provide a vendor's extension point to add other persistence counters.

6. **The meeting was terminated early due to an emergency event that Pete needed to handle. Hence the remaining issues 3) – 5) that were raised in MFD email list were not discussed.**
   - Agreed that we may discuss these issues on MFD email list.

7. **Next Teleconference will be on December 2, Thursday, 3pm EST.**
   Have a happy Thanksgiving!